

They're not even afraid of God: Several apartments have been received with forged documents in Osh.



While casualties of the tragic events of June 2010 are patiently waiting their turn, common criminals get apartments with the help of officials.

Gulzat Gaziyeva, Voice of Freedom, Osh

Numbers of problems have arisen with the allotment of apartments among for the victims of the events of June 2010. Some have managed to obtain housing illegally with public servants' support and using forged documents.

Currently, the Interregional Department on Combating Organized Crime and Anti-Corruption is investigating these cases and studying criminal schemes. On the basis of the facts revealed alone, it is estimated that the state suffered damage in the amount of 10 million soms (about \$ 213 million).

Victims are patiently waiting, and swindlers ...

The queue at the door of the Osh Municipal Property Department (MPD) is not getting shorter. People who suffered from the events of June 2010 hope to find housing in one of the multistory apartment houses of the city. Adina Sydykova lost her husband in a riot that time. To get an apartment she provided all the necessary documents 2,5 years ago. But her turn has still not come. She says: "We, the relatives of the killed, wounded or injured in that tragedy, come here every day. As usual we are assigned a date and told, "Come on the fifth, then on the tenth ...". And this long-drawn-out procedure has been lasting 2.5 years. We have tried to be patient. But our patience can't be endless after all. We thought of not taking the apartments, but we have lost loved ones and children. " More than 10 people with the same problems are waiting at the doorstep of the MPD.



Victims in line are afraid to be photographed, thinking that it might hinder them in getting the long-awaited apartments. And those aren't afraid of the officials, or laws, or God ...

According to them, they do not understand how the apartments are being allocated. Maksuda Rakhmanova who lost her mother and younger brother in the June riots says, "We can't show any proof, but heard that some people have got housing illegally."

Only relatives of the dead and missing during the ethnic conflict on June 2010 have the right to get apartments. But some of the people who were not victims of the June events provided false documents and got apartments illegally.

"Victims" are being brought out into the open...

Employees of the department on combating organized crime and corruption of the IAD (Internal Affairs Department) in Osh have revealed instances of fraud. A 19 year-old resident of Osh, N.J., applied to MPD to obtain an apartment. She provided the death certificate of her 41-year old mother, allegedly killed during the June events. That document was received from the Osh bureau of forensic medicine with the help of the expert K.A. A representative of the MPD and the State Commission on Housing Allotment Executive Secretary was involved in that conspiracy too; she had signed resolution № 3, according to which N.J. later received a three-room apartment.

During the investigation, it was found that the woman allegedly killed in Osh events, was in fact murdered at her home on June 25, 2010. She was killed by her husband's relative Onubay Akmatov in Kara-Kulja district. The Kara-Kulja district Court convicted him of murder and sentenced him to 12 years in prison.

Akmatov is in Osh prison number 25 at present, where he is serving his sentence. Criminal proceedings have been instigated against N.J., the forensic medical expert, and the MPD employee.

One of the applicants, B.J., from the same Kara-Kulja district said that during the June events, his wife and baby died in a nursing home after being left without medical care. This statement had been accepted by the executive secretary of the State Commission, B.A., despite the lack of supporting evidence of the death of the mother and her baby. Subsequently, B.J. received a three-room apartment illegally based on the city commission resolution № 4.

Verification regarding the pregnant women revealed the following. In connection with the pathology of the patient, the doctors from Kara-Kulja hospital sent her to Osh, where she gave birth to an extremely premature infant. But in spite of timely medical care, both she and the newborn died. In that case a forensic examination was not carried out.

The commission on housing allotment in Osh City, without properly checking the collected documents, issued resolution number 8, under which B.J. received an apartment. Thus, the state suffered damage in the amount of 1 million 837 thousand soms.

Another resident of Osh, K.K., filed a statement that her husband had been wounded in the head during the riots and later died in hospital. However, no document certifying the death of her husband was provided. Nevertheless, she was given a two-room apartment. After the inspection it was found that citizen wounded in the head was not an officially-registered victim.

Using their official status for their own gain ...

During a review of the allotment of houses to those who suffered in the June events, the audit company "Osh-Audit" revealed several cases of abuse by civil servants. For example, acting MPD Deputy Director N.K. entered into an agreement with the Housing Allotment Sector specialist B.A. They forged a certificate from the neighborhood committee № 3 certifying that several families had been living in a burned-down house. As a result, N.K. illegally provided 3 three-bedroom apartments to his father, wife and his daughter-in-law.

Abduvakhab Abdullazhanov, the Head of neighborhood committee № 3, wrote that only 3 persons had been registered in the burned house. In his explanatory letter he mentioned that he hadn't provided any forged certificate.

During the investigation of a former employee of the MPD, N.K. , it was revealed that his wife had her own housing. DMP specialist B.A. provided false information to the commission, but actually did not provide the necessary certificates from the State Registry, the Emergencies Ministry and others. Then, according to the resolution № 5 of 20 July 2011, the Commission allotted a three-room apartment to N.K's wife.

According to the technical passport, the burned house belonged to N.K., a former employee of the MPD. (Data sheet from Osh Fire Fighting Service on July 22, 2010, and certificate from State Register on June 27, 2012).

The false casualties on the June events supposedly lived at the same address and in the same house, and managed to get 3 three-bedroom apartments, although at first these apartments should have been transferred to the balance of the local mayor. Material damage to the state is estimated at over 5 million 300 thousand soms (\$ 113,000). Thus, N.K., using his official status as a member of the commission, "carved out" 3 three-bedroom apartments for his relatives. Proceedings have been instituted against him.

All of the above instances are being thoroughly investigated, and in particular, all documents to whom the secretary of the commission, B.A., had access. She promised to assist the victims in obtaining housing in multistory apartment houses and was caught red-handed with a bribe of 50 thousand soms. Investigations are currently underway. In this case, the law enforcement agencies have noted that they have not revealed all the details, suspecting that still other people may be involved in the fraudulent allotment of housing.

Intermediaries profit off of the victims...

Osh MPD Director Alimbay Kadyrov doesn't deny that some mistakes have been made in housing allotments. At the same time, he insists that now not a single apartment will be allotted illegally. Kadyrov has established a commission and has found incorrect decisions on the allocation of four apartments, and has filed an application to the courts. Four citizens had allegedly forged documents about burned and damaged homes, and received housing illegally. However, the court returned two of the apartments to the state.

MPD Director Alimbay Kadyrov says, "We have re-organized the review commission and slowly rechecked all the facts, revealed illegal allocation of apartments to four citizens and have applied to the court. There have been a lot of obstacles, but we have been able to win back two apartments. I think the fate of other two apartments will be decided in our favor. "

He also notes that the intermediaries, having won the confidence of victims, cheat them using corrupt schemes. According to him, there is a list of victims in the MPD and the IAD. Everybody knows about it.

"For example, you need an apartment and, say, your name is in the list. Two people introduce themselves, one as a distant relative, and one as my acquaintance. They say, "We have already spoken [to Kadyrov], and he suggests buying an apartment for 10 thousand US Dollar." Then the swindlers take half of that amount. This is how such swindlers cheat unsuspecting people. Unfortunately, some of employees of government agencies are involved in such swindles, " Alimbay Kadyrov says.

A 52-year-old woman named Aiyumkan was arrested by IAD employees. She introduced herself as representing the Public Organization "Ochpos ot" ("Eternal Flame") and promised to assist in obtaining housing for victims of the June events. She swindled from 4 to 27 thousand soms out of poor people, which she later simply embezzled. In that case, within ten days 18 people went to the police with a statement about Aiyumkan's misconduct. During a search of her house documents on compensation received by citizens were discovered. A criminal case has been opened.

The main problem: the commission's decisions are not transparent

According to the terms, after affected citizens' documents are approved by the MPD they are sent to the city commission. The Municipal Council City Commission reviews the documents and sends them to the State Commission. The State Commission, according to the regulations, examines all documents establishing the rights to housing and allots the apartments.

There are 16 people in the Municipal Council City Commission, but the committee members are constantly changing. The head of the State Commission is the Vice Prime Minister of Kyrgyzstan Ibragim Junusov. The State Commission's staff consists of Parliament deputies, local government officials, non-governmental organizations and victims' representatives. The composition of the State Commission is also changing.

The public is concerned about the lack of information on the meetings of city and state commissions. Attempts to obtain the necessary information about the dates of the upcoming MPD meetings on the housing allocation have not been successful. There isn't any information about meetings schedule and other items of information. Civic requests for resolutions of the city and state commissions also remained unanswered. The public has no way to obtain the necessary information on the websites of these organizations.

The representatives of non-governmental organizations are the members of the State Commission too. The Head of the Public Fund "Demilgeluu ishker ayaldar" ("Active women entrepreneurs") Avazkan Ormonova is a member of the state commission. She says that they are not notified of the regular meetings of the commission 2-3 days in advance and some procedures are not observed during the meetings.

For example, at one of those meetings the Chairman of the State Commission Gulnara Asymbekova could not coordinate the work of the committee of 19 people. The members of commission started to quarrel; nobody adhered to the rules.

"We wanted the commission's work to be covered in the media and for all decisions to be published on the internet. But the Chairman did not say "yes" or "no." The present deputies expressed their neutrality too, showing just professional irresponsibility. If those deputies can't vote on the issue of apartment allocations,

they should withdraw from the commission,” State Commission member Avazkan Ormonova has said.

The Head of the Osh branch of the NGO "Interbilim" Gulgaky Mamasaliyeva also has confirmed that there is no information about upcoming meetings and the commission's work and proceedings are questionable.

Gylkaky Mamasaliyeva says, “Illegal decisions have been revealed during reviews. The allocation of apartments wasn’t monitored by public organizations. Therefore, we do not have definite data on the violations which have been committed. We have no idea how decisions on categorizing victims have been made.”

According to her, the citizens who lost their loved ones during the events of June 2010, still continue to refer to them. According to the accepted Degree of the Government of Kyrgyzstan, housing should be primarily provided to those whose family members are confirmed dead.

"In the list of people who have gotten apartments, there are representatives of law enforcement agencies. It is unclear in which houses victims have been settled. There are no listings on the Internet. Such a situation causes outrage among the people, so we need transparency, " Gulgaky Mamasaliyeva says.

She also noted that the committee meeting should be open to the victims who provide all the necessary documents for apartments. In general, all citizens have the right to supervise the activities of the state commission.

Apartments are being allocated, but how?

The number of applications for housing among the victims in Osh is 943. After the consideration by the state commission, 469 applications have been approved. Since August 2010 to the present, the State Directorate for the Restoration of the Cities of Osh and Jalalabad has built 34 multi-storey houses. The total number of apartments is over 1200. 395 citizens and their family members have moved in the new apartments.

In the allocation of apartments, according to the Regulation, priority is to go to relatives of victims of the tragic events, missing persons, as well as citizens who were badly injured during the riots, or who lost their own homes or whose property has been transferred to the state.

In the near future, according to Executive Secretary of the Commission and Osh MPD Chief Alimbay Kadyrov the allotment of apartments will be finished. An investigation into illegal allotment apartments is going on in parallel. The above mentioned revelations indicate the need for further investigation of such cases by law enforcement agencies.

The facts already identified may be the beginning of large-scale disclosures of criminal fraud and corrupt practices that have taken place in the allotment of apartments among citizens of Kyrgyzstan who suffered during the June 2010 events.

Gulzat Gaziyeva, Voice of Freedom, Osh

Material has been prepared with the financial support of SCOOP.

You might help the heroes article if share the link. Thank you.